

Centre for Food Safety
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Notes of the Sixty Fifth Meeting of the Trade Consultation Forum
held on 10 August 2018 at 2:30 p.m.
in Conference Room at Room 102, 1/F, New Wan Chai Market,
258 Queen's Road East, Wan Chai, Hong Kong

Present

Government Representatives

Dr. Samuel YEUNG	Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment & Communication)	(Chairman)
Dr. Henry NG	Principal Medical Officer (Risk Assessment and Communication)	
Mr. Peter TSANG	Superintendent (Import/Export) ³	
Ms. CHOW Shuk Man	Scientific Officer (Biotechnology)	
Mr. HO Kwok Wai	Scientific Officer (Salt Reduction)	
Ms. Mindy LAM	Agricultural Officer (Risk Assessment)	
Mr. WONG Wai Nang	Chief Health Inspector (Other Licensing) Headquarters	
Mr. CHAN Kar Chun	Chief Health Inspector (Hygiene)	
Mr. LUI Chun Hung	Senior Health Inspector (Food Labelling) ¹	
Mr. CHIANG Fat Kwai	Superintendent (Risk Communication)	(Secretary)

Trade Representatives

Ms. LAU Mei Lee	A & W Food Service (HK) Ltd.
Ms. YEUNG Yuk Yue	A.S. Watson
Ms. NG Hin Yan	A-1 Bakery Co., (HK) Ltd.
Mr. Andrew WONG	Abbott Laboratories Limited
Mr. Vincent LAU	AEON Stores (Hong Kong) Co., Limited
Ms. Elaine CHOW	AEON Stores (Hong Kong) Co., Limited
Ms. Lilian TANG	Aeon Topvalu (Hong Kong) Co., Limited
Ms. WONG Mei Lam	ALF Retail Hong Kong Limited (Marks & Spencer)
Ms. Rita KU	ALS Technichem (HK) Pty Ltd.
Ms. Rebecca MAK	Amoy Food Limited
Ms. CHENG Yuk Shan	Angliss Hong Kong Food Service Ltd.
Mr. LAM Pak Wah	Best Harvest Food Company Limited
Ms. Peggie YAU	Brand's Suntory (Hong Kong) Ltd.

Mr. Kenrick CHU	Bureau Veritas Hong Kong Limited
Mr. TSANG Wah Him	Calbee Four Seas Co. Ltd.
Ms. Silvana FUNG	China Dragon Inspection & Certification (H.K.) Ltd.
Mr. Chi WONG	China Inspection Co., Ltd.
Ms. Maggie LEUNG	China Resources Vanguard (H.K.) Co., Ltd.
Ms. CHAN Sze Wing	CIAO International Limited
Ms. SUEN Wai Yan	City Super Limited
Ms. May KAN	Coca-Cola China Ltd.
Mr. Victor Machamba	Consulate General of Zimbabwe
Ms. CHAN Shuk Ping	CR Care Co., Ltd.
Ms. IU Wun Cheung	CR Care Co., Ltd.
Ms. KWOK Sze Man	CR Care Co., Ltd.
Mr. Thomas WONG	Crystal Jade Culinary Concepts Holding (Great China) Ltd.
Ms. Tonia LEUNG	Crystal Jade Culinary Concepts Holding (Great China) Ltd.
Ms. LEUNG Kwan Yee	Dah Chong Hong
Mr. Carlo C. Catingan	Dole Hong Kong Limited
Ms. Kacila LEUNG	Enviro Labs Limited
Ms. Wing CHEUNG	Eurofins Food Testing Hong Kong Limited.
Mr. Jason CHOI	Eurofins Food Testing Hong Kong Limited.
Ms. LEE Ka Man	Ever Rich Food Development Ltd.
Ms. Carol LAW	Fonterra Brands (HK) Ltd.
Mr. Henry CHENG	Fonterra Co-operative Group Limited
Mr. Freddy FONG	Foodscan Analytics Ltd.
Ms. Karen CHIU	FrieslandCampina (Hong Kong) Limited
Ms. Noel HO	Garden Heart Food Ltd.
Mr. Chris CHAN	General Mills Hong Kong Ltd.
Mr. POON Kuen Fai	The Association for Hong Kong Catering Services Management Ltd.
Mr. Evan LEUNG	Hong Kong Disneyland
Ms. Chloe LAU	Hong Kong Yakult Co., Ltd.
Mr. CHAN To	Hung Fook Tong
Ms. Becky CHEUNG	International Food Safety Association
Mr. Thomas LAM	International Food Safety Association
Ms. Georgina SHEK	International Food Safety Association
Ms. Sum AU	Island Shangri-la Hotel
Ms. Amy MOU	Itochu HK Ltd.
Mr. CHOW Tin Yam	Japan External Trade Organization
Ms. Alice WONG	Lee Kum Kee International Holdings Ltd.
Mr. Kenneth KWAN	LH Group

Ms. Amy YEUNG	Maxim's Caterers Ltd.
Ms. Eva POON	Nestle Hong Kong Ltd.
Mr. Herbert LEE	Nissin Foods (H.K.) Management Co., Ltd.
Ms. German CHEUNG	Pappagallo Pacific Limited
Mr. Jimmy TSANG	ParknShop (HK) Ltd.
Ms. Launita CHAN	Polybrands International Ltd.
Mr. LO Tak Wing	PRIZEMART
Mr. Kenneth LAM	Prominent International (Environmental) Ltd.
Ms. Eva TANG	Regal Hotels International Limited
Mr. Timothy CHOY	Saraya (HK Sales) Co., Ltd.
Ms. Amy YIP	Sims Trading Company Limited
Mr. Nick LEUNG	Snow Brand HK Co., Ltd.
Mr. WONG Kam-chuen	Swire Coca-Cola HK Limited
Mr. CHOI Chun Yin	Tea-ed Limited
Mr. Alfred NG	The Dairy Farm Company, Limited -Wellcome
Ms. Faye LEUNG	The Dairy Farm Group
Mr. LING Tsun Kit	The Garden Company Limited
Ms. TSE Ching Po	The Hong Kong Jockey Club
Mr. FUNG Chun Yin	The Hong Kong Jockey Club
Ms. Abby WONG	Tingyi-Asahi Beverages Holding Co., Ltd.
Ms. Anna LAM	Tsit Wing Coffee Co., Ltd.
Mr. CHAN Chi Kong	Vitasoy International Holdings Ltd.
Mr. TSE Siu Ki	Wellab Limited
Mr. LAM Tsz Mau	Winner Food Products Ltd.
Ms. Jolene MAN	Yuen Loong & Co., Ltd.

In Attendance

Dr. Avis MAK	Assistant Secretary for Food & Health (Food)SD2/Food and Health Bureau
--------------	--

Opening Remarks

The Chairman welcomed all trade representatives to the 65th meeting and introduced government representatives to the meeting.

Confirmation of the Notes of Last Meeting

2. The notes of last meeting were confirmed without amendments.

Agenda Item 1

Risk Assessment Study on Perchlorate in Tea and Tea Beverages

3. Ms. CHOW Shuk Man shared with the meeting the result of a recent risk assessment study on perchlorate in tea and tea beverages. Perchlorate was a chemical that was formed naturally in the atmosphere and surface water. The source of perchlorate contamination was the use of perchlorate-containing fertilisers and irrigation water, industrial emission, and degradation of chlorine-based disinfectants. Human exposure to perchlorate occurred primarily through ingestion of food and water. Vegetables, fruits, spices, tea, milk and their products were important contributors to perchlorate exposure. Sustained exposure to sufficiently high level of perchlorate could lead to hypothyroidism, which would adversely affect the structural and functional brain development in the foetus, infant and child, and also metabolism and functioning of cardiovascular, gastrointestinal, skeletal, neuromuscular and reproductive systems in adults. The Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) evaluated the safety of perchlorate in 2010, and established a Provisional Maximum Tolerable Daily Intake (PMTDI) of 0.01 mg/kg bw/day (i.e. 10 mg/kg bw/day) for perchlorate. However, Codex Alimentarius Commission had not established any maximum limits (MLs) for perchlorate, and there was no regulation stipulating the MLs for perchlorate in foods in the US, the EU and other countries. In early 2016, local media reported that Mainland-produced tea leaves available in Europe were found to contain higher levels of perchlorate. The Centre for Food Safety (CFS) collected 30 imported tea leaf samples in the local market for

testing of perchlorate levels. All samples collected passed the tests. In response to public concern and in order to have a more in-depth knowledge of the level of perchlorate in tea and tea beverages in Hong Kong, the (CFS) conducted the risk assessment study and analysed perchlorate levels in over 300 samples of dried tea leaves and tea beverages available in the local market. The dietary exposure to perchlorate of the Hong Kong adult population arising from the consumption of these tea products was estimated, and the potential health impact due to exposure to perchlorate from tea products was assessed. Sampling work was conducted from June to August 2017, which covered nine groups of dried tea leaves and tea beverages commonly consumed by the local population. It was found that perchlorate was present in the majority (96%) of samples, but the dietary exposure to perchlorate from tea and tea beverages was only 0.12% of the PMTDI for average consumers and 0.31% of the PMTDI for high consumers. It was concluded that adverse health outcome due to perchlorate exposure of the Hong Kong adult population from dried tea leaves and tea beverages commonly available in the local market was remote.

Agenda Item 2

Introduction of the Revision of “Guidelines on Food Classification for the Pesticide Residues in Food Regulation”

4. Ms. Mindy LAM briefed the meeting of the revision of the “Guidelines on Food Classification for the Pesticide Residues in Food Regulation” (the Guidelines). To enhance regulatory control of pesticide residues in food, starting from 1 November 2018 pesticide residues in “mungbean sprouts”, “soya bean sprouts” and “lotus tuber” would be included within the scope of Schedule 1 to the Pesticide Residues in Food Regulation (Cap. 132CM) (the Regulation). “Mungbean sprouts” and “soya bean sprouts” would be classified under the food group “Leafy vegetables (including Brassica leafy vegetables)” and 65 Maximum

Residue Limits (MRLs) / Extraneous Maximum Residue Limits (EMRLs) would be applicable to “mungbean sprouts” and “soya bean sprouts”. “Lotus tuber” would be classified under the food group “Root and tuber vegetables” and 53 MRLs/EMRLs would be applicable to “lotus tuber”. While no amendment of the Regulation was needed, the Guidelines would be revised accordingly. Currently, “mungbean sprouts”, “soya bean sprouts” and “lotus tuber” had not been included in the Guidelines. Given that the three food commodities were commonly consumed locally, the CFS would classify the three food commodities under the corresponding food groups in the Guidelines, with reference made to Codex’s relevant classification. The new measure had been supported by the Working Group on Standard Setting for Pesticide Residues in Food and endorsed by the Expert Committee on Food Safety. The CFS had uploaded the electronic version of the revised Guidelines to the CFS website, with a summary of major revisions included. The Guidelines were provided for information only and were not legally binding, and should not be interpreted to override the provisions of the Regulation. After implementation of the new measure, the CFS would take samples of the three food commodities at import, wholesale and retail levels for testing through routine Food Surveillance Programme. The CFS would notify relevant stakeholders before implementing the new measure through the CFS website and Facebook page, technical meeting and Trade Consultation Forum.

5. One trade representative asked whether the CFS had any plans to classify other food items such as “lotus seed”, “lotus seed pod”, “linseed” and “chia seed”. Ms. Mindy LAM replied that the CFS would keep in view of the latest development in the classification of food items adopted by the Codex and also internationally to assess whether further classification and new measures would need to be implemented. The trade representative remarked that the classification should take into consideration of the food consumption preference of the local population and enable the trade to perform safety assessment. The Chairman remarked

that in view of the abundance of food items in the market, similar to other countries it might not be feasible to classify all items. Under the local Regulation, if there was no specific classification for some food items concerned, the food group higher in the food classification may be relevant, or else risk assessment would be conducted. The CFS would include as many food items in Schedule 1 of the Regulation as possible after taking into consideration of the latest classification adopted by the Codex. It might not be appropriate to establish MRLs/EMRLs by ourselves for some food items which had not been covered by the Codex. The trade representative also asked whether part (a) of each group of food item in the Guidelines which specified the 'portion of the commodity to which the MRL applies' was information provided by the CFS for reference only or the requirement of the Regulation. Ms. Mindy LAM replied that the information was provided based on the Codex's recommendation on the analysis method for each kind of food item, and was not specified in the Regulation. The trade representative remarked that for "durian", the standard of portion of the fruit to be tested for MRLs of the Codex was different from that adopted by the Mainland. For the sake of clarity he suggested that the testing portion of each commodity should be included in the Regulation. Ms. Mindy LAM remarked that the CFS would conduct testing of the products based on the Codex standard and the Guidelines. Dr. Henry NG remarked that the Codex would review and update annually the relevant standards on pesticide residues and the CFS would keep in view of the developments. The trade representative asked whether local guidelines targeting locally consumed products could be established for the trade's reference. The Chairman remarked that the Guidelines had taken into consideration of local products in the classification which may not strictly follow the Codex classification.

6. Another trade representative suggested that for commodities which did not have Codex standards, we should follow the standards of the Mainland for reference since most

commodities were imported from China. The Chairman said that the CFS would make reference to the standards of other jurisdictions in addition to the Codex in devising guidelines and regulations.

7. One trade representative remarked that the retail sector of the trade did not want too many food commodities specified under the Guidelines which meant a tightening of control for the Regulation. The Chairman remarked that the Guidelines were established to facilitate the trade to understand the Regulation, and the CFS has been closely monitoring the latest international development and would update the Guidelines as necessary and appropriate.

Agenda Item 3

Introduction of the Centre for Food Safety's Instagram page for "Hong Kong's Action on Salt and Sugar Reduction"

8. Mr. HO Kwok Wai remarked that salt and sugar are closely related to health. Excessive dietary salt intake would increase the risk of developing hypertension, stroke and coronary heart diseases. Excessive dietary sugar intake would lead to obesity and dental caries. He informed the meeting that to promote healthy eating with less salt and sugar to the general public and the food trade, the CFS had officially launched a dedicated Facebook page on Hong Kong's Action on Salt and Sugar Reduction (HKASSR) (www.facebook.com/HongKongsActiononSaltandSugarsReduction) in January 2015. To further promote messages on the reduction of salt and sugar in food to people from different sectors and age groups through different social media, the CFS had officially launched a dedicated Instagram page on HKASSR (www.instagram.com/hkassr/) in July 2018. The trade was encouraged to visit the Facebook and Instagram pages to obtain relevant

information and news on the promotional activities.

9. One trade representative asked what the planned activities to be organized under the initiative of salt and sugar reduction were. Mr. HO Kwok Wai remarked that the CFS had been organizing activities such as school competitions in the past to promote the theme of salt and sugar reduction. The activities and information on the theme were publicized in the dedicated HKASSR page of the CFS website and also the Facebook and Instagram pages. Dr. Henry NG supplemented that the new term of the Committee on Reduction of Salt and Sugar in Food had started in March 2018 and the CFS would organize a series of publicity activities on the theme in this financial year. The CFS would continue to publicize results of risk assessment studies and would also liaise with restaurants to encourage them to serve dishes with reduced salt levels. The Chairman remarked that the Government has released an action plan on the prevention and control of non-communicable diseases which encompassed a series of different actions including salt and sugar reduction. The current work on salt and sugar reduction undertaken by the CFS was part and parcel of this action plan.

10. One trade representative quoted the example of Chinese sausage and complimented the CFS in the successful reduction in the use of salt in the food item by the trade. The Chairman thanked the efforts made by the trade in accomplishing the objective of reducing salt and sugar levels in food.

Agenda Item 4

Enhanced Arrangement on Import Control Measures of Japanese Food

11. Mr. Peter TSANG informed the meeting that a review had been conducted on the import

control on Japanese food. The prime consideration of the review was to safeguard food safety. Factors considered included local surveillance result, assessments of international expert organizations, surveillance result of the Japanese authority, latest situations on import control of Japanese food by other economies, consistency of related control measures with the requirements of World Trade Organization, and public concern. After the review, the Government had announced an enhanced arrangement on import control measures with effect from noon 24 July 2018. Conditional import of vegetables, fruits, milk, milk beverages and dried milk (concerned food types) from Chiba, Gunma, Ibaraki and Tochigi prefectures to Hong Kong was allowed, subject to the provision of exporter certificate and radiation certificate. The import of vegetables, fruits, milk, milk beverages and dried milk from Fukushima prefecture to Hong Kong was prohibited as was currently. There was also no change to the conditions of import of chilled or frozen game, meat and poultry, poultry eggs, and live, chilled or frozen aquatic products from all prefectures. Two levels of gatekeeping could effectively safeguard food safety. Export control would be exercised by the Japanese authority to ensure concerned food types of every consignment come from Ibaraki, Tochigi, Chiba or Gunma and to certify radiation levels of concerned food types do not exceed the Codex standards and the more stringent Japanese standards. Import control would be performed by the CFS to conduct radiation test for every consignment of imported Japanese food, and to strengthen sampling of vegetables, fruits and milk products from the above-mentioned four prefectures for testing radiation levels. The CFS would strengthen communication with the Japanese authority in exchanging information and intelligence. The trade was encouraged to keep the labels of Japanese food and if the food products were split for sale, provide the public with information on the prefecture where the food is originated on the package.

12. One trade representative remarked that a lot of snacks from Japan and South East Asian

countries on sale in Hong Kong had not indicated their origin of manufacture, expiry date and ingredients. She wished the CFS could pay attention to the matter. Mr. LUI Chun Hung remarked that the CFS had from time to time received complaints and referrals on such food items. Legal action would be taken on the traders concerned if they were found to breach the requirements of the Food and Drugs (Composition and Labelling) Regulations (Cap. 132W). The CFS would continue to step up surveillance in this respect. He solicited the trade to abide by the concerned Regulations in providing necessary food labelling for the products concerned, such as proper labelling of food allergens.

13. One trade representative remarked that the Japanese radiation level standard for radioactive Caesium in food (which was more stringent than the Codex standard) was 100 Bq/kg for 'general food' and 50 Bq/kg for 'milk' and 'food for infant and young children'. But it was noted that the CFS would request retailers to remove from sale food products with radiation level as low as 10 Bq/kg. He wondered whether such food items could be put on sale. Mr. Peter TSANG replied that Hong Kong followed the Codex standard and food products with such low levels of radiation could be put on sale. The information was only provided to the public for their knowledge. The trade representative said that under the circumstances the retailers would be under immense pressure to remove the concerned products from sale. When the products met the specified standard, it would not be appropriate for CFS staff to ask the retailers whether they would consider removing them from sale. The Chairman remarked that informing the public of the radiation levels in food was carried out after the Fukushima incident was to address public concern. In Hong Kong we adopted the Codex standard of 1,000 Bq/kg for all food items and food with radiation levels below this standard could be put on sale. Asking the retailers on whether the products would be removed from market voluntarily was in order to avoid market confusion. The point raised by the trade representative was noted and the CFS would review the practice

from time to time. The trade representative asked whether it was still necessary to conduct market surveillance of Japanese food as all imported Japanese food items were already tested and the safety level was high. The Chairman agreed that the safety of imported Japanese food had been maintained and the Government would constantly review the practice and measures adopted in this aspect.

Agenda Item 5

Licensing Control on Sale of Hairy Crab

14. Mr. WONG Wai Nang informed the meeting of the new licensing control arrangements on the sale of hairy crabs with effect from 3 September 2018. Under the Food Business Regulation (Cap. 132X), save with the written permission of the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (DFEH), no person shall sell any restricted foods, including shell fish. Hairy crab is a kind of shell fish and written permission must be obtained from FEHD for the sale of the food item. For physical shops and online shops selling hairy crabs, they must obtain the Shell Fish (Hairy Crab) Permit and the Restricted Food Permit (Online Sale of Restricted Food) respectively. Sale of hairy crabs at other licensed food premises (such as licensed fresh provision shops) or fish stalls in public markets must obtain relevant endorsement from FEHD. The major licensing requirements and conditions of the Shell Fish (Hairy Crab) Permit included: the provision of refrigerator and wash-hand basin and hairy crabs for sale must be obtained from lawful sources accompanied with health certificates acceptable to the DFEH. The permit applicant could either be in the name of an individual or corporation.

15. One trade representative asked whether the operators of the premises under application for relevant permits would need to attend the hygiene supervisor and hygiene manager

training courses. She understood that a lot of the online shop operators did not have fundamental knowledge of food hygiene matters. Mr. WONG Wai Nang remarked that as the upcoming licensing control on sale of hairy crab which involves no further food processing with comparatively low food safety risks, the control of the business through the issue of permit with less stringent requirement than that of a food business licence was considered appropriate. Although it was not a requirement for the concerned operators to obtain relevant qualifications related to food hygiene issue, they are obliged to observe the licensing conditions imposed. Health Inspectors from District Environmental Hygiene Offices will conduct routine inspection and offer health education whenever necessary.

16. One trade representative asked whether the new licensing control arrangements would cover those restaurants selling hairy crabs. Mr. WONG Wai Nang replied that the control mechanism would only be applicable to hairy crabs without further processing before sale. For licensed restaurants which process and cook the hairy crabs for serving as dishes to their customers, the new permits or additional endorsement to sell the hairy crabs is not applicable.

17. One trade representative asked why the requirements for selling of hairy crabs in respect of retail shops were different from that in public markets. Mr. WONG Wai Nang replied that the licensing requirements for the two kinds of premises were in fact similar.

18. Another trade representative asked about the requirements for licensed fresh provision shop to obtain additional endorsement for sale of hairy crabs. Mr. WONG Wai Nang replied that the shop would be required to provide a refrigerator of suitable capacity to store the crabs which should be stored in separate compartment if being stored together with other commodities in the refrigerator.

Any Other Business

19. One trade representative remarked that in respect of the Colouring Matter in Food Regulations (Cap. 132H), Part II in Schedule 1 listed some ‘colouring matter natural to edible fruits or vegetables’. In May 2009 the CFS had provided some colouring matters not included in the Schedule, which had been uploaded to the CFS website. As the said colouring matters were allowed to be used, he wondered whether they would be included in the Schedule. He also wanted to know whether all natural colouring matters in fruits and vegetables could be used, irrespective of whether they were on the list in Schedule 1. The Chairman replied that since there was no relevant information in hand, he would follow up later.

[Post- meeting note: In Hong Kong, the edible colouring matter is regulated by the regulations made under section 55 of the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap. 132). All permitted colouring matters in food are listed under the Schedule 1 of the Colouring Matter in Food Regulations (Cap. 132H). Any colouring matters not specified in Schedule 1 shall not be used in Hong Kong. The list that the trade representative referred to was examples of colouring matters natural to fruits and vegetables. However, the trade should exercise their own discretion on choice of ingredients, including colouring matter, etc., of their products to ensure it is fit for human consumption and compliance with the relevant legislation in Hong Kong.]

20. A trade representative enquired whether it would be possible for CFS to set up a hotline for handling trade enquiries over food safety regulations. The enquiries could be referred to relevant sections in CFS for follow-up as the FEHD hotline was unable to answer their enquiries thoroughly. The Chairman replied that since CFS was responsible for enforcing food safety regulations, it might not be in an appropriate position in clarifying the relevant

laws. The trade was advised to seek legal advice should it need any clarification.

21. Another trade representative enquired whether the proposed amendment of setting MLs for lead in wine in the Food Adulteration (Metallic Contamination) Regulations (Cap. 132V) would be applicable to other liquors that contained wine, for example, sparkling wine and punch. The Chairman replied that the classification of wine in the Regulations was made in accordance with the corresponding Codex standards. And in determining whether a product containing wine ingredients would be classified as wine, CFS would calculate the proportion of wine in those products prior to testing by means of the same Codex standards. In response to the same trade representative's enquiry on whether the authority would plan to set out MLs for other substances like pesticide residues in wine in the near future, the Chairman replied that the existing food safety regulations were applicable to all sorts of food including wine as long as they met the definition of "food". Therefore, even if no MLs of other contaminant or pesticide residues were set for wine specifically, they were controlled by other general food safety regulations and standards.

22. Another trade representative asked about the proposed ML for cadmium in edible fungi in the coming amendment of Cap. 132V. Dr. Henry NG replied that edible fungi was classified as "Vegetables unless otherwise specified" which was made in accordance with Codex classifications when referring to the MLs of cadmium. The ML for cadmium in edible fungi was therefore 0.1 mg/kg. The same trade representative supplemented that the trade had confusions in the conditions of edible fungi, whether fresh or dried, when measuring the ML for a particular contaminant or residue. As many of the retailers in the trade were selling dried mushrooms, they were much concerned that the conditions of the samples and the procedures of processing the samples before testing would greatly affect the testing results. The Chairman replied that the current testing on edible fungi was conducted

in the state of being fresh. The testing results of dried samples were generated according to the conversion factor of that particular food type which had been supported by academic reference. Similar examples had been published in CFS' publication "Food Safety Focus" for reference.

23. The same trade representative also remarked that the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs of PRC had recently revised the ML for cadmium in blaze mushrooms as 10 mg/kg while the corresponding standard in Hong Kong was 0.1 mg/kg. He would like to understand the reasons of setting this stringent standard and the possibility of relaxing it to meet that in China though he understood that the consultation period of the proposed regulation amendment had ended. He viewed that the physical environment of growing edible fungi and other vegetables were much different and therefore the standard of metallic contaminants content should not be equal. The Chairman replied that the trade and the public had been well informed and welcomed to the forums throughout the consultation period. He also pointed out that the testing results of edible fungi including blaze mushrooms in hand could meet the prevailing standards. He invited the trade representative to the technical meeting for further discussion over the matter.

24. A trade representative expressed her inclination to join the technical meeting as well for exchanging views with the CFS. The Chairman welcomed the representative to the meeting. He replied that the trade members would receive invitations by email as well as through online promulgation.

25. A trade representative expressed concern on whether cocoa husk pigment listed in GB2760, a natural colouring matter found in cocoa beans, should also be regarded as one of the 'colouring matter natural to edible fruits or vegetables' specified in Schedule 1 of Part II

of the Colouring Matter in Food Regulations (Cap. 132H). The Chairman replied that since no technical data about this colouring matter was available at the moment, he would follow up the issue later.

[Please refer to the **Post-meeting note** under paragraph 19 on page 14.]

26. A trade representative asked that which part of hairy crabs would be sampled by the CFS for dioxin testing. The Chairman replied that the edible portions of a hairy crab including both white meat and brown meat would be tested.

27. A trade representative asked whether a retailer would be bound by the Shell Fish (Hairy Crab) Permit requirement if customers only redeemed hairy crabs at physical shops by means of coupons ordered online. Another trade representative expressed similar concern. She would like to know whether a retailer would be required to obtain the Permit if she only sold coupons and had no direct contact with the hairy crabs which were to be delivered by a third party to the customers directly. Mr. WONG Wai Nang explained that sale of hairy crabs in Hong Kong whether through physical shops or online platforms would be under licensing control. Food business of Shell Fish (Hairy Crab) Permit involved sale of hairy crabs through online platform should obey the relevant licensing conditions. Type of licence/permission required would depend on the actual mode of operation of the business.

28. A trade representative asked about the practice in categorising edible fungi in testing for different metallic contaminants. When testing the mushrooms for contaminants like lead, there was a specific category named as “Edible fungi” while it was absent for other metallic contaminants. The trade representative would like to know, under such circumstances, the prevailing practice of CFS in categorising the mushroom samples. The Chairman replied that in the absence of a specific category, the samples should then be treated in a more general category which in this case mushroom should be categorised as vegetables instead.

29. The same trade representative asked how the CFS would sample peeled or prepacked frozen durian for MRLs testing of pesticide residues. He understood that the whole durian would be used for the testing but there were no conversion factors between durian shell and durian. The Chairman replied that he would follow up with his colleagues who were responsible for testing and answer later. Regarding prepacked frozen durians, it would be most favourable to obtain samples of the whole durian including the shell at the source for comprehensive testing from the perspective of food safety risk management.

[**Post- meeting note:** Traders could make reference to the "Guidelines on Food Classification for the Pesticide Residues in Food Regulation (Cap. 132CM)" (the Guidelines) issued by the CFS for the portion of the commodity to which the MRL applies and which is analysed. Regarding the testing of peeled or prepacked frozen durian, the laboratory would analyze the sample as at received and follow the Guidelines as far as practicable.]

Date of Next Meeting

30. The date of next meeting would be decided later.

31. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:03 p.m.